

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
HOUSTON DIVISION

FOOD NOT BOMBS HOUSTON  
ET AL.,

卷之三

Plaintiffs,

Case No. 4:24-cv-338

v.

(Consolidated Case: No.  
4:23-cv-1206)

CITY OF HOUSTON, TEXAS,

Defendant.

18

## 10 ORAL DEPOSITION OF

RENEE BECKHAM

FEBRUARY 13, 2025

15 ORAL DEPOSITION OF RENEE BECKHAM, produced as a  
16 witness at the instance of the Plaintiffs and duly  
17 sworn, was taken in the above styled and numbered cause  
18 on Thursday, February 13, 2025, from 9:10 a.m. to  
19 2:49 p.m., before DONNA QUALLS, Notary Public in and for  
20 the State of Texas, Notary ID No. 12161359, reported by  
21 computerized stenotype machine, at the offices of  
22 Houston City Hall Annex, 900 Bagby Street, 4th Floor,  
23 Houston, Texas, pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil  
24 Procedure, and any provisions stated on the record or  
25 attached hereto.

## **EXHIBIT**

D

1 aware that, the last time someone may have inspected,  
2 they inspected the site where the product was being  
3 prepared.

4 Q. Okay. So to your knowledge, the last time that  
5 investigation happened was in 2018?

6 A. Only -- the only two at the -- at 500 McKinney.  
7 And I don't know if y'all have that complaint  
8 investigated by Mr. Bradshaw.

9 Q. Yes. Let's turn to that.

10 A. Right.

11 Q. All right. I'm handing you what I marked at  
12 Exhibit No. 45.

13 (Exhibit No. 45 was marked.)

14 Q. (BY MR. HIROSHIGE) And I apologize. The text  
15 on here is pretty small, but this is just like the way  
16 it printed.

17 Do you see at the top here there's a -- it  
18 says date received 04-01-2020?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And underneath that it says "EHS assigned:  
21 Jerry Bradshaw"?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Okay. So at the very start of this deposition,  
24 you mentioned that you would review some complaints in  
25 preparation for your testimony today?

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 148

1 A. Uh-huh.

2 Q. Is this one of the documents you reviewed?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And just now, this is the investigation by  
5 Jerry Bradshaw you were referring to?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And who is Jerry Bradshaw?

8 A. He's -- he's one of the chief sanitarians now.

9 Q. Okay. And at the time in April of 2020, what  
10 was his role?

11 A. He was probably just a supervisor. Probably  
12 just a sanitarian supervisor in 2020.

13 Q. Okay. And then at the top here it says  
14 "Facility Name: Central Library. Address:  
15 500 McKinney."

16 Do you see that?

17 A. Right. Yes.

18 Q. And under service requested it reads "I'd like  
19 to report unsanitary conditions at a food distribution  
20 site at the Houston Public Library. 500 McKinney  
21 Street, Houston, Texas 77002. There's a group that sets  
22 up and distributes food to the homeless every Monday,  
23 Wednesday, and Friday at 7:30 p.m. at the main downtown  
24 library. Until last night, they were distributing food  
25 in front of city hall but are now back at the library.

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 149

1 They also distribute lunch every day at 4:00 p.m. They  
2 are set up on the Lamar Street of the library near the  
3 intersection of Lamar Street and Brazos."

4 Have I read that correctly so far?

5 A. I got it.

6 Q. Are you following along -- okay.

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 150

1 time that the unsanitary conditions are resolved, halt  
2 the distribution of food in these unsanitary  
3 conditions."

4 Did I read that right?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Okay. So this -- so this complaint isn't about  
7 the food that's being provided outside the library; is  
8 that right?

9 A. Right.

10 Q. It's about the environment where the food is  
11 being provided, right?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And when this complainant refers to infection,  
14 do you understand that to be referring to COVID-19?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Okay. And as we -- so now if you turn or look  
17 with me to the investigation report records.

18 Do you see that section?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And it says the investigator is Jerry Bradshaw,  
21 right?

22 A. Uh-huh.

23 Q. And it looks like he investigated this  
24 complaint on April 3rd, 2020; is that right?

25 A. Yes.

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 151

1           Q. I'm going to read the investigation report  
2 records. It says "Surveyed downtown library site for  
3 homelessness feeding event. Observed sidewalk with  
4 separating lines of chalk with the distance of 6- to  
5 7-foot increments. Observed men and women standing,  
6 waiting for food service.

7            "I interviewed the person in charge of  
8 organization, Food Not Bombs subgroup Coronavirus Relief  
9 Meals, Shere Dore. Ms. Dore stated a wait for food to  
10 be delivered for the feeding. I explained to Ms. Dore  
11 the need for separation of the recipients of the food as  
12 a order from the mayor. Ms. Dore was in agreement and  
13 will work it and ensure social distant rule.

14            "There was average around 95 people waiting  
15 for food from Express in Spring, Texas. The food  
16 temperature was 103 degrees. The food is packaged in  
17 hinged carry-out Styrofoam containers covered in a  
18 plastic T-shirt-style carry bag.

19            "Ms. Dore's group gave out numbers to the  
20 men and women respective to the number of meals. There  
21 were only 65 meals given. Ms. Dore group ensured social  
22 distance was maintained as the recipient number was  
23 called. Ms. Dore group ensured waste was removed while  
24 in our presence.

25            "I observed Ms. Dore group was not listed

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 152

1 on the approved charitable feeding list. I e-mailed her  
2 information on obtaining approval."

3 Did I read that correctly?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And so Jerry Bradshaw spoke with Ms. Dore at a  
6 feeding outside the Central Library; is that right?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And he observed that there were sidewalks --  
9 chalk lines in the sidewalk for social distancing?

10 A. Uh-huh.

11 Q. Is that --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Okay. And Mr. Bradshaw shared with Ms. Dore  
14 that there needed to be social distancing because of the  
15 pandemic; is that right?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And according to Mr. Bradshaw, Ms. Dore ensured  
18 that everyone in line abided by social distancing rules  
19 while they were receiving food; is that right?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And according to Mr. Bradshaw, Ms. Dore ensured  
22 that the waste from the charitable feeding was removed  
23 at the end; is that right?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And then at the bottom of this report, it lists

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 153

1 outcome. And then do you see at the very bottom it says  
2 date closed, 4-5-2020?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And the request disposition, it was resolved?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. What does it mean for the outcome to be  
7 resolved?

8 A. It means that the conditions may or may not  
9 have existed. And based on the inspector's  
10 investigation, it's been corrected.

11 Q. Okay. So it means Mr. Bradshaw did not have  
12 any continuing concerns about the charitable feedings  
13 outside the library after his investigation, right?

14 A. Not that I'm aware of.

15 Q. Okay. Now, you talked about a 2018 moment  
16 where the health department -- where you investigated a  
17 group that was serving meals across the street from --

18 A. The Beacon.

19 Q. -- The Beacon. And then we've also reviewed  
20 this 2020 investigation by Jerry Bradshaw of a Food Not  
21 Bombs feeding outside the Central Library, right?

22 A. Right.

23 Q. Now, aside from those two instances, are you  
24 aware of any other instances where the health department  
25 investigated a charitable feeding?

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 154

1           A. One ongoing. I think I mentioned Loaves &  
2 Fishes earlier.

3           Q. Okay.

4           A. In their -- I guess in their patio, we got a  
5 complaint. The weekend inspector went out there, and  
6 they were -- the organization -- I don't remember the  
7 name of the organization. They weren't feeding them in  
8 accordance with food safety. So there was issues with  
9 the manner of which the food was being provided or  
10 uncovered food. So you're serving buffet style, and you  
11 have food just totally exposed.

12           Q. And when you -- so was it -- do you know if  
13 Loaves & Fishes authorizes other groups to provide  
14 charitable feedings on their patio?

15           A. This was the first that I had heard --

16           Q. Okay.

17           A. -- that they even had charitable feeding on  
18 their property because they have a kitchen. But I think  
19 on Sundays or Sunday mornings they don't feed. So  
20 that's probably why they do that.

21           Q. And Loaves & Fishes itself provides meals to  
22 homeless people during the week, right?

23           A. Yes.

24           Q. But it provides those meals on their own  
25 property?

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 180

1

## ERRATA PAGE

2

WITNESS NAME: RENEE BECKHAM DATE: 02/13/2025

3

PAGE LINE CHANGE REASON

4

---

5

---

6

---

7

---

8

---

9

---

10

---

11

---

12

---

13

---

14

---

15

---

16

---

17

---

18

---

19

---

20

---

21

---

22

---

23

---

24

---

25

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 181

1 I, RENEE BECKHAM, have read the foregoing  
2 transcript and hereby affix my signature that same is  
3 true and correct, except as noted above on the previous  
pages(s), and that I am signing this before a Notary  
Public.

## RENEE BECKHAM

THE STATE OF )  
COUNTY OF )

Before me, , on this day personally appeared, RENEE BECKHAM, known to me or proved to me under oath or through (description of identity card or other document), to be the person whose name is subscribed to the foregoing instrument and acknowledged to me that they executed the same for the purposes and consideration therein expressed.

Given under my hand and seal of office on this, the  
\_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2025.

Notary Public in and for  
The State of Texas  
Commission Expires: \_\_\_\_\_

Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 1821 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION  
2 ORAL DEPOSITION OF  
3 RENEE BECKHAM  
4 TAKEN FEBRUARY 13, 20255 I, DONNA QUALLS, Shorthand Reporter and Notary  
6 Public in and for the State of Texas, Notary ID  
7 No. 12161359, hereby certify to the following:8 That the witness, RENEE BECKHAM, was duly  
9 sworn by the officer and that the transcript of the oral  
10 deposition is a true record of the testimony given by  
11 the witness;12 That the original deposition was delivered to  
13 RANDALL HIROSHIGE;14 That a copy of this certificate was served on  
15 all parties and/or the witness shown herein on  
16 \_\_\_\_\_.17 I further certify that pursuant to FRCP No.  
18 30(f)(i) that the signature of the deponent was  
19 requested by the deponent or a party before the  
20 completion of the deposition and that the signature is  
21 to be returned within 30 days from date of receipt of  
22 the transcript. If returned, the attached Changes and  
23 Signature Page contains any changes and the reasons  
24 therefor.

25 I further certify that I am neither counsel

1 Renee Beckham

February 13, 2025  
Page 183

1 for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties in  
2 the action in which this proceeding was taken, and  
3 further that I am not financially or otherwise  
4 interested in the outcome of the action.

5 Certified to by me this 28th day of February,  
6 2025.

7   
8  
9

10 DONNA QUALLS  
11 Notary Public in and for  
12 The State of Texas, Notary ID 12161359  
13 My Commission expires 11/06/2026

14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
Magna Legal Services  
Firm Registration No. 633  
16414 San Pedro, Suite 900  
San Antonio, Texas 78232  
(210) 697-3400